

National Research University
Higher School of Economics

Manuscript copyright

Nemova Mariia Igorevna

**Alternative Payment Means as a Subject Matter and an Instrument
of Crimes in the Domain of Economy**

Dissertation Summary for the purpose of obtaining
academic degree Doctor of Philosophy in Law

Academic supervisor:

Markuntsov Sergey Aleksndrovich,

Doctor of Science, assistant professor

Moscow – 2020

The thesis was completed at the Department of judicial systems and criminal law of the Faculty of Law of the National Research University "Higher School of Economics"

The text of the thesis is deposited and available on the website of the Higher School of Economics: <https://www.hse.ru/sci/diss/>

12.00.08 – Criminal Law and Criminology; Criminal Executive Law

The relevance of the research topic. The study of alternative payment means (hereinafter – APM) as the subject matter and an instrument of crimes in the domain of economy is relevant, since law enforcement practice, analytical reports, and media reports indicate the commission of economic crimes against or using the APM. APM is a familiar and popular phenomenon: almost everyone has ever used at least one of the types of APM – bonus points, virtual currencies in games, cryptocurrencies, etc. At the same time, the existing law enforcement practice is contradictory in cases of crimes related to APM in terms of recognizing such acts as criminal or non-criminal and crimes qualification. There is also no uniform position on these issues in the scientific and educational literature. Within the framework of this thesis, the issues of crimes qualification in the domain of economy related to APM are demonstrated on the example of cryptocurrencies, currencies of multi-user online games, and units of consumer loyalty programs. These types of APM are the most common, and there is also law enforcement practice in cases of crimes committed against or through these types of APM.

The lack of legal regulation of APM turnover creates additional challenges in the qualification of crimes. The emergence of new regulations in this area, in particular Federal law No. 259-FZ of July 31, 2020 "On digital financial assets, digital currency and amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation", which is due to enter into force on January 01, 2021, also requires its interpretation in the context of considering digital currencies as a subject matter and instrument crimes.

The state of scientific development of the topic. APM as a subject matter and an instrument of crimes in the domain of economy was not the subject of separate research at the level of dissertations, monographs, and scientific articles, since the very concept of APM is not well-established in jurisprudence. The research of APM as an independent category in the economic literature is devoted to the works by D.B. Berg, E.A. Poryvkin, A.A. Ryabin, and others. M.V. Bashkirova, A.S. Genkin, A.B. Nadich, A.I. Timofeev, F. Hayek, K.Yu. Khvatov, and E.V. Sharavina studied the categories that intersect with the APM – private money

and monetary surrogates. In the legal literature, attention was mainly paid to the categories-the antipodes of APM – money, legal tender, and currency: they were studied by M.A. Korostylev, I.I. Kucherov, L.A. Lunts, and others. In addition, the legal literature analyzed certain types of APM, such as cryptocurrency (L.B. Nigmatulina, L.A. Novoselova, A.I. Savelyev, A.V. Sazhenov, D.V. Fedorov, I.A. Tsindeliani), virtual currencies of multi-user online games (V.V. Arkhipov), units of consumer loyalty programs (V.L. Dostov, Yu.V. Surodeev, P.M. Shust), etc.

The works of A.G. Bezverkhov, V.V. Khilyuta, A.V. Shulga, P.S. Yani, etc. are devoted to the study of the phenomenon of the subject of crimes against property. V.N. Vinokurov, E.A. Geivanov, S.V. Izosimov, and E. A. Maslakova studied the category of means of committing a crime, including R.G. Aslanyan, A.V. Gladkikh, R. I. Dremlyuga, and V.P. Konyakhin in the context of information technology development.

The issues of criminalization and qualification of crimes against and with the use of APM were considered mainly in relation to only one type of APM – cryptocurrency. This topic was studied by E.G. Bykova, M.M. Dolgieva, E.A. Ilyashenko, A.A. Kazakov, A.A. Korennaya, R.A. Lavronenko, D.A. Ryaguzova, E.L. Sidorenko, and Yu.V. Truntsevsky. The exception is the works of G.A. Esakov and S.A. Markuntsov, which consider monetary surrogates and quasi-finances, as complex categories that are close in content to the APM.

The object of the thesis is social relations in the field of economy, which require criminal law protection from crimes committed against and with the use of APM.

The subject matter of the research includes current and expired norms of criminal, financial, civil, tax, and constitutional legislation of domestic and foreign countries, as well as materials for the enforcement of these norms; explanations of authorities; statistical, reference, and analytical materials; consumer loyalty program and end-user license agreement for multi-user online games; scientific research.

The purpose of the research is to study the category of APM as a subject matter and an instrument of crimes in the domain of economy, as well as to formulate recommendations for the qualification of such crimes, improving criminal legislation and the practice of its application.

To achieve the above goals, the following **objectives** are set:

- formulate the concept of APM, identify their features and types;
- analyze the main approaches to legal regulation and the legal nature of the APM;
- to investigate the social and legal validity of the criminal law protection of public relations on the turnover of APM;
- consider APM as a subject matter of crimes against property and an instrument of committing crimes in the domain of economic activity and crimes against the interests of the service in commercial and other organizations;
- develop rules for the qualification of economic crimes committed against or using cryptocurrencies, virtual currencies, multi-user online games, and consumer loyalty units, and make proposals for improving criminal legislation in the relevant area.

Methodology and methods of research. The research used general scientific methods of cognition-formal-logical and system-structural methods, methods of analysis and synthesis, induction and deduction, as well as special legal methods – formal-legal and comparative-legal. Analysis, synthesis, induction, and deduction make it possible to form conclusions and hypotheses. System-structural and comparative-legal methods are necessary when analyzing the essence of APM as an independent category, as well as the subject matter of a crime and the instrument of its commission. Formal-logical, formal-legal methods contribute to the construction of sound conclusions.

The legal normative basis of the research consists of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, Civil Code of the Russian Federation, Federal law of July 10 2002 № 86-FZ "On the Central Bank of the Russian Federation (Bank of Russia)" Federal law of 31 July 2020 № 259-FZ

"On financial digital assets, the digital currency and on amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation", Federal law dated 27 June 2011 No. 161-FZ "On national payment system", Federal law dated 07 August 2001 No. 115-FZ "On countering the legalization (laundering) of proceeds from crime and the financing of terrorism" and other federal laws and regulations.

The theoretical basis of the study presented scientific works on criminal law (A.V. Arkhipov, M.V. Bavsun, Yu.M. Baturin, A.G. Bezverhov, M.M. Dolgieva, G.A. Esakov, A.A. Korennaya, N.A. Lopashenko, S.A. Markuntsov, S.V. Polubinskiy, E.A. Russkevich, E.L. Sidorenko, V.V. Khiluta, A.V. Shulga, P.S. Yani, etc.), civil law (B.L. Nigmatulina, L.A. Novoselova, A.I. Savelyev, D.V. Fedorov, I. A. Tsindeliani, etc.) and financial law (V.L. Dostov, I.I. Kucherov, I.B. Lagutin, L.A. Luntz, A.B. Nadich, A.V. Sazanov, P.M. Shust, etc.).

The empirical base of the research mainly consists of materials from judicial practice. The text of the dissertation uses 71 judicial acts, including 59 of them were issued in criminal cases, 12 in civil cases, 2 in arbitration cases, 2 in administrative cases, and 1 in an administrative offense case. Chronologically, 2 of these judicial acts were issued in 2011, 2 in 2012, 4 in 2013, 4 in 2014, 7 in 2015, 4 in 2016, 9 in 2017, 24 in 2018, and 15 in 2019. In addition, we analyzed reports published in the media and other open sources about economic crimes related to the APM, as well as data from analytical reports on the state of crime in the domain of cryptocurrency turnover, virtual currencies, multi-user online games, and consumer loyalty program units.

Novelty of the research. This study is the first Russian dissertation research of the APM as a subject matter and instrument of committing crimes in the field of economy. In addition, the problems of criminalization and qualification of crimes related to certain types of APM – cryptocurrency, virtual currencies of multi-user online games, and units of consumer loyalty programs-were not analyzed in detail earlier at the monographic and dissertation levels. The dissertation describes the author's definition of the concept of APM, their features, functions, and types, and

considers approaches to determining the legal nature and legal regulation of APM. Taking into account the common features and differences between different types of APM – cryptocurrencies, virtual currencies of multi-user online games, and units of consumer loyalty programs, the rules for qualifying acts committed against APM or using them are formulated, and the direction for improving the criminal law is proposed.

As the **Dissertation presentation**, the following scientific statements, conclusions, and recommendations are being submitted:

1. APM are the counterparts of legal tender does not have its own actual (cash) value and performs the function of a measure of value, means of circulation, and means of payment within the limits established by the rules of the turnover of the APM, the agreement of the parties or the technical implementation of the billing system.

Signs of ASR are:

- subsidiary character in relation to legal tender;
- lack of its own actual (commodity) value;
- the limited scope of turnover;
- the limited liquidity.

2. According to the classification of APM presented in the dissertation research, it can be:

- depending on the form of presentation: documentary and digital (non-documentary);
- depending on the issuer's status: public and private;
- depending on the availability of collateral for other assets: secured and unsecured;
- according to the specifics of determining the cost: related and unrelated to the rate of legal tender.

Special criminally-legal value has the classification of APM depending on the form submission because the presence or absence of physical cover can be a

criterion of differentiation of crimes under Chapter 21 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. The presence or absence of a link between an APM and a legal tender directly affects the specifics of determining the amount of damage caused by a violation of the turnover of the APM.

3. To determine the amount of damage from a crime, you should be guided by the market value of the APM at the time of the end of the crime. The cost of APM that is not linked to the rate of legal tender should be determined on the basis of an expert's or specialist's opinion. The methodology for assessing the APM should take into account such criteria as the volatility of the exchange rate of a particular APM, its limited liquidity, urgency of use, and the right of the issuer of the APM to stop accepting it.

4. APM may be an instrument of committing crimes under chapters 22 and 23 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. Depending on the criminal purpose, to achieve that use APM, the proposed classification of crimes into four groups:

- violation of the restrictions of transactions (articles 171¹, 171², 171³, 171⁴, 191, 191¹ of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation);
- concealment of previous criminal activity (articles 174, 174¹, and 175 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation);
- concealment of property for the purpose of default (articles 177, 195, 199² of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation);
- bribery (articles 184, 2005, 2007, 204, 2041 the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation).

If the established transaction restrictions are violated, the use of the APM does not create qualification difficulties, but it can be a form of counteraction to the detection and investigation of crimes.

When qualifying crimes related to the concealment of previous criminal activity, special attention should be paid to the subjective side of the crime. In particular, in the classification of crimes specified in articles 174 and 174¹ of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, the use of APM for the conspiracy and

the subsequent conversion of APM into legal tender can be considered as committed with the purpose of giving a lawful appearance to possession, use and disposal of property acquired through criminal activity, if the use and conversion were associated with the commission additional financial transactions impractical, difficult to establish the criminal origin of the property. In itself, the use of APM does not indicate that there is a goal of legalizing (laundering) property obtained by criminal means.

There are no criminal obstacles to bringing to criminal responsibility for crimes related to non-fulfillment of obligations, as well as bribery.

5. Crimes in relation to virtual game currency is property, the victim of which is a legal user of a multi-user online game, and the sign of self-interest specified in part 2 of article 272 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation and part 2 of article 273 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation does not absorb property crimes that can be committed using the methods specified in articles 272 and 273 of the criminal code. If the virtual game currency falls out of the actual control of the copyright holder of a multi-user online game, the property damage is not caused by real damage, but by lost profits, and such acts are proposed to be qualified under article 165 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

6. Illegal use of someone else's bonus card by the guilty person at the self-service checkout or by entering its number on the website should be qualified as theft, the subject matter of which is the items purchased by the guilty person. If the offender gets the opportunity to dispose of units of consumer loyalty programs (hereinafter – UCLP) by the method, paired with overcoming computer protection and violation of normal functioning of information systems and objects, such act constitutes fraud in the field of computer information (article 159⁶ of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation) the subject matter of which is UCLP.

7. If the guilty person, using his official position, spends illegally accrued UCLP for full or partial payment of goods of buyers who are unaware of the criminal intent, and then turns in his favor the funds received from buyers and

equal in amount to the part of the price of the goods paid with points, then such an act must be qualified as embezzlement of funds. The use of improperly accrued UCLP to pay for goods entrusted to the guilty persons and used by them for their own benefit should be considered as misappropriation of the corresponding goods. If the person who is entrusted with the organization's property pays for the purchase of another person with illegally accrued UCLP, then such an act is embezzlement. If the guilty person receives a job or service instead of a thing instead of bonuses, then the act must be qualified as causing property damage by deception or abuse of trust (article 165 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation).

8. In a situation of an illegal write-off of UCLP to employees of the organization who have the authority to make settlements with customers using bonus points, the consumer's UCLP is not entrusted to the guilty persons. If the guilty person writes off the buyer's UCLP and at the same time appropriates the funds received from him in the amount equivalent to the amount paid by bonuses, then such an act should be qualified as a fraud.

The theoretical significance of the study is to fill the gap in scientific knowledge about APM as a subject matter and instrument of committing crimes in the field of economy. The results of the study can be used for further analysis of criminal liability for crimes in the field of economy and the category of APM and for the development of related topics.

Practical significance of the dissertation paper. The results of the study can be used in making appropriate legislative changes and in law enforcement practice in the qualification of economic crimes related to APM. In addition, the provisions of this work can be material for study and discussion when teaching legal disciplines.

Reliability and validity of the research results. The use of various sources of scientific research, namely, the appeal to both theory and practice, the study of not only domestic but also foreign sources provided factual reliability and validity of the research results. The research methodology contributed to a comprehensive

approach to solving the tasks set, mutual verification, and comparability of the research results and their methodological validity and reliability. The results of the study are consistent with each other, as well as with the results of some previous research conducted by other authors and positions in law enforcement practice.

Approbation of the research results. The paper was prepared in the Department of judicial systems and criminal law of the National Research University Higher School of Economics, where its main provisions were discussed. The main results of the study were used in the course of conducting classes in the discipline "Criminal law" as part of the pedagogical practice. The provisions submitted for defense were presented at conferences with subsequent publication of abstracts in collections, including the XVII International scientific and practical conference "Criminal law: development strategy in the XXI century" (Moscow, 2020), the XV International scientific and practical conference "Criminal law: development strategy in the XXI century" (Moscow, 2018), the XI Russian Congress of criminal law, dedicated to the memory of doctor of law, Professor V.S. Komissarov, "Ensuring national security-a priority area of criminal law, criminology and penal enforcement policy" (Moscow, 2018), X scientific and practical conference of young scientists "Actual problems of legal science and practice: the view of young scientists" (Moscow, 2018), XVII International scientific conference of students, undergraduates, and postgraduates "Interaction of modern legal systems for sustainable development of society" (Grodno, 2017). Also, during the preparation of the dissertation, the results of the research were discussed based on the results of a speech at the XII International school-workshop of young legal scientists on the topic: "Composition of the legal space: dynamics of renewal" (Moscow, 2017).

10 scientific articles have been prepared and published on the topic of the dissertation research, 5 of which are in the leading peer-reviewed scientific journals included by the Higher Attestation Commission of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation in the list of publications designated to publishing the main scientific results of dissertation research papers

intended for receiving the credentials of a candidate of doctoral science degree, including 3 in the Additional list of journals, publications in which are taken into account when assigning the academic allowance of level 1 and in evaluating publication activity at the National Research University Higher School of Economics.

The structure of the dissertation is determined by the sequence and content of the goals and objectives of the research, as well as the logic of the presentation of the material. The work consists of an introduction, three chapters including twelve paragraphs, as well as a conclusion, a list of sources, and two appendices.

THE MAIN CONTENT OF THE THESIS

The introduction describes the relevance of the topic of the dissertation research, the degree of its scientific development, the object and subject matter, the goals and objectives of the research, the methodology and methods of the research, its normative, theoretical and empirical base, and scientific novelty. The provisions submitted for defense are formulated, the theoretical and practical significance, as well as the reliability and validity of the research results are justified, information about their approbation is indicated, and the structure of the dissertation is described.

The first chapter "Alternative payment means: concept, types and legal nature" is devoted to the economic and legal analysis of the APM category and consists of three paragraphs.

Section 1.1 "The Concept of Alternative Payment Means" compares the categories-antipodes of the APM – fiat money, legal tender, and money, and briefly describes the historical experience of the development of the APM. The main features of APM are highlighted: subsidiary nature in relation to legal tender, lack of its own actual (commodity) value, limited scope of turnover and liquidity. On the comparison of the functions of money and the APM found that APM have a reduced functionality compared to the set of features of APM can be different for each type, but all types of APM partially perform the function of measure of value, means of circulation and means of payment. The author's definition of the concept of APM is proposed taking into account the functions of the APM and their main features. It is proposed to understand under the APM as counterpart of legal tender does not have its own actual (cash) value and performs the function of measure of value, means of circulation and means of payment within the limits established by the rules of the turnover of the APM, the agreement of the parties or the technical implementation.

Section 1.2 "Types of Alternative Payment Means" describes specific common types of APM – virtual currencies (including cryptocurrencies), UCLP, means of

payment of social networks, electronic money, local money, military money, money of unrecognized and partially recognized states. The list of types of APM is not exhaustive. In addition, the classification of APM depending on presentation – documentary and digital (paperless), depending on the status of the issuer – public and private, on the basis of availability –secured and unsecured, according to the specifics of determining the cost they can be related or unrelated to the course of legal tender.

Section 1.3 "Approaches To Determining The Legal Nature And Regulation Of Alternative Payment Means" considers the possibility of regulating APM as monetary surrogates and private money, directly money (their fiction), securities, information, goods or things, property rights, digital rights, and other property. As a result, it is concluded that APM have a property essence. Taking into account the current legal regulation, centralized APM should be classified as property rights of a binding nature, and decentralized APM should be classified as other property. If the law establishes the characteristics of information systems in which digital currency and (or) other types of APM are traded, these APM will be classified as digital rights.

The second chapter "Criminal Law Protection Of Public Relations In The Economic Domain From Attacks Committed Against Or Using Alternative Payment Means", consisting of three paragraphs, deals with the general problems of criminal law protection of public relations in the economic sphere from attacks committed against or using APM.

In section 2.1, "Social And Legal Validity Of Criminal Protection Of Public Relations On The Turnover Of Alternative Payment Means", APM is considered as a social and legal value that should be subject to criminal protection. Arguments are given about the public danger and the prevalence of encroachments on economic relations in the turnover of APM. Given the value and prevalence of APM, their proprietary nature, typical of social relations according to their turnover it is concluded that public relations turnover APM should be subject to

criminal law protection under chapter 21 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

Section 2.2 "Alternative Payment Means as the Subject Matter of Property Crimes" draws attention APM do not have the physical attribute of the traditional definition of the object of theft, except for APM with a physical carrier that has a nominal value, which are currently almost non-existent. Because of the lack of APM physical characteristic of the subject of the theft unlawful mercenary attacks on the turnover of the APM (except e-money), harmful to the owner of APM, can be qualified according to the articles in Chapter 21 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation not related to the theft. The thesis also notes that currently, non-self-serving crimes against APM are not actually criminally punishable, since it is traditionally believed that the subject of these crimes must also have a physical sign. The problem of the inability of the criminal law to protect property relations in the information society is proposed to be overcome by refusing to differentiate criminal liability depending on the presence of a physical feature of the subject of property crimes. In addition, the section analyzes the problem of the availability of the cost of the APM. APM have an economic feature of the subject matter of the crime, exchange and consumer value: they participate in civil turnover and are able to meet needs by performing the functions of a measure of value, a means of circulation and a means of payment. The recommendation is given to be guided by the market value of the APM at the time of the end of the crime, which, if there is a need to use special knowledge, should be determined on the basis of an expert's or specialist's opinion.

In section 2.3 "Alternative Payment Means as an Instrument of Committing Crimes in the Domain of Economic Activities or Crimes against Interests of Service in Commercial and Other Organizations" concluded that APM is an instrument and not the subject matter of crimes stipulated in chapters 22 and 23 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation, as the specific object of these crimes is not directly associated with the APM and through the impact of APM impossible to harm or to threaten harm to the order's economic activities or normal

functioning of services in organizations. The lack of legal regulation of the turnover of the APM makes it easier to conceal the movement of property that is used in the commission of a crime or acquired as a result of its commission, the source of origin of such property, and the fact of its existence. Depending on the criminal purpose for which the APM is used, a classification of the crimes under consideration is proposed. When considering the issue of criminal law protection of the procedure for issuing and turnover of APM, it is concluded that such criminal law protection is impossible if the procedure for issuing and turnover of APM is not established in the regulatory legislation.

The third chapter "Qualification of economic crimes committed against and through certain types of alternative payment means" deals with the problems of qualification of economic crimes against or using specific types of APM – cryptocurrencies, virtual currencies, multi-user online games, and UCLP.

Section 3.1 "Qualification of economic crimes committed against and through cryptocurrencies" analyzes the legal regime of cryptocurrency turnover and its impact on the criminal protection of public relations on cryptocurrency turnover. The approaches of various authors to the qualification of property crimes against cryptocurrencies are considered. The literature suggests various ways to solve the problem of insufficient criminal law protection of public relations on the turnover of cryptocurrencies: adding special norms to the criminal law, considering APM as legitimization signs, spreading the fiction of a thing on them, and rejecting the physical sign of the object of theft in Chapter 21 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. As an optimal way to overcome the difficulties that arise in connection with bringing to justice for encroachments against cryptocurrencies, it is proposed to reform chapter 21 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation by eliminating the differentiation of liability depending on whether the subject matter of the crime has a physical attribute. The paragraph also discusses the possibility of criminalizing violations of the established procedure for cryptocurrency turnover, provided that such an order is established in the regulatory legislation. It is noted that for the purposes of combating crime, using cryptocurrency, it is very important

the introduction of KYC (know your customer) that is possible only in case of development of legal regulation of cryptocurrency.

Section 3.2 "Qualification of economic crimes committed in relation to and through virtual currencies of multi-user online games" examines the criteria for distinguishing between "game" and real crimes, and provides recommendations for identifying the victim of crimes against virtual game currencies. When committing property crimes against virtual game currency the real damage is caused to the player who invested money or labor in virtual property, and not to the copyright holder who provided the player with virtual property and game currency. It is concluded that it is necessary to qualify encroachments on virtual game currency as a property crime, which is not absorbed by the crime against computer information. Situations, where virtual game currency or other virtual property is removed from the actual control of the copyright holder of an online multiplayer game, are considered separately. In such cases, property damage does not consist in causing real damage, but in lost profits, and such acts are proposed to be qualified under article 165 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. It is noted that the lack of regulation and control, anonymity, and the ability to move virtual game currencies virtually without contact with financial and credit organizations make virtual currencies of multi-user online games a potential means of committing crimes under chapters 22 and 23 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

Paragraph 3.3 "Qualification of economic crimes committed in relation to and through the use of consumer loyalty programs" suggests that the subject matter of the crimes under consideration should be treated differently depending on the circumstances of the crime and the person who was harmed by the crime. If the act is committed through the accrual of bonus points in the absence of the grounds provided for by the consumer loyalty program, the damage is caused to the organization that accepts such bonus points "for payment", and the subject matter of the crime should be recognized as property values that the guilty person receives through the use of illegally accrued UCLP. If the guilty party uses bonus points

that were illegally debited from another person's bonus account, the damage is caused not to the organization that issued and accepted bonuses, but to the owner of the bonus account. More over, the issue of competition between the rules on liability for theft and fraud in the payment of bonus cards is analyzed. Special attention is paid to cases of use of official position in the commission of property crimes related to the UCLP. Recommendations are given for determining the amount of damage caused as a result of encroachment against or using the UCLP. It is stated that UCLP can be used in the commission of crimes under chapters 22 and 23 of the criminal code of the Russian Federation, despite its low liquidity compared to money or cryptocurrency.

In **conclusion**, possible prospects for the development of legislation and law enforcement are considered, taking into account the conclusions made as a result of the study.

The list of sources contains references to normative legal acts used in the dissertation, official documents, materials of judicial practice, foreign legislation and practice of its application, monographs, scientific articles, dissertations and dissertation abstracts, textbooks, manuals and comments, analytical reports and results of sociological surveys, Internet resources, consumer loyalty programs, end-user license agreements for multi-user online games.

Appendix No. 1 is issued in the form of a draft law "On Amendments to the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation", which proposes to reform Chapter 21 of the criminal code of the Russian Federation. **Appendix No. 2** contains a table with an analysis of 50 judicial acts issued in cases of legalization (laundering) of funds or other property acquired by a person as a result of committing a crime using cryptocurrency.

MAIN PUBLICATIONS ON THE TOPICDISSERTATION RESEARCH

Research papers with a total volume of 4.6 printed pages were published on the research topic.

Articles in periodicals included in the list of HSE recommended

journals:

1. Nemova M.I. Use of Cryptocurrency in the Legalization (Laundering) of Money or Other Property Acquired by Criminal Means: Analysis of Law Enforcement Practice // Criminal Law. 2019. No. 4. Pp. 63-68.
2. Nemova M. I. Cryptocurrency as a Subject of Property Crimes // Law. 2020. No. 8. Pp. 145-154.
3. Nemova M.I. Criminal Liability of Employees of Organizations for Illegal Self-Serving Accrual and Write-Off of Bonus Points Of Consumer Loyalty Programs // Criminal law. 2019. No. 6. Pp. 64-69.

Other articles:

4. Nemova M.I. Criminally Relevant Risks of Turnover of Alternative Payment Means // Russian Investigator. 2018. No. 10. Pp. 50-53.
5. Nemova M.I. History of Legal Regulation (Prohibition) of Alternative Means of Calculation // History of State and Law. 2018. No. 10. Pp. 37-42.
6. Nemova M.I. Non-Socialized Economic Benefits as Objects of Criminal Law Protection // Interaction of Modern Legal Systems for Sustainable Development of Society: Collection of Scientific Articles Grodno: GRSU, 2017. Pp. 314-317.
7. Nemova M.I. Determining the Cost of Alternative Payment Means in Criminal Cases // Criminal Law: Development Strategy in the XXI Century: Materials of the XVII International Scientific and Practical Conference. Moscow: RG-Press, 2020. Pp. 170-175.
8. Nemova M.I. Criminal Liability for Encroachments on Virtual Property in Multi-User Computer Games // Ensuring National Security is Priority Direction of Criminal Law, Criminology and Criminal Enforcement Policy: Materials of the XI Russian Congress of Criminal Law Dedicated to the

- Memory of Doctor of Law, Professor Vladimir Sergeevich Komissarov, Held on May 31 – June 1, 2018. Moscow: Yurlitinform, 2018. Pp. 171-174.
9. Nemova M.I. Criminal Liability for Encroachments on Virtual Game Currency // Actual Problems of Legal Science and Practice: the View of Young Scientists: Collection of Materials of the X Scientific-Practical Conference of Young Scientists (Moscow, April 27, 2018). / Ed. by A.Yu. Vinokurov, K.A. Komogortseva, A.S. Semenov; UN-T Prosecutor's Office of Russia. Moscow, 2018, Pp. 215-220.
 10. Nemova M.I. Criminal Law and Cryptocurrency: Challenges And Prospects // Criminal Law: Development Strategy in The XXI Century: Proceedings of the XV International Scientific and Practical Conference. Moscow: RG-Press, 2018. Pp. 583-586.